

**Delft University of Technology** 

### Composition and distribution of the near-shore waters bordering the coral reefs of Aruba, Bonaire, and Curaçao in the Southern Caribbean

van Duyl, Fleur C.; Post, Vincent E.A.; van Breukelen, Boris M.; Bense, Victor; Visser, Petra M.; Meesters, Erik H.; Koeniger, Paul; Vermeij, Mark J.A.

DOI 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2024.117297

Publication date 2024 **Document Version** Final published version Published in Marine Pollution Bulletin

**Citation (APA)** van Duyl, F. C., Post, V. E. A., van Breukelen, B. M., Bense, V., Visser, P. M., Meesters, E. H., Koeniger, P., & Vermeij, M. J. A. (2024). Composition and distribution of the near-shore waters bordering the coral reefs of Aruba, Bonaire, and Curaçao in the Southern Caribbean. Marine Pollution Bulletin, 209, Article 117297. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2024.117297

### Important note

To cite this publication, please use the final published version (if applicable). Please check the document version above.

#### Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download, forward or distribute the text or part of it, without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license such as Creative Commons.

Takedown policy

Please contact us and provide details if you believe this document breaches copyrights. We will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

### Marine Pollution Bulletin



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/marpolbul

## Composition and distribution of the near-shore waters bordering the coral reefs of Aruba, Bonaire, and Curaçao in the Southern Caribbean

Fleur C. van Duyl<sup>a</sup>, Vincent E.A. Post<sup>b,1</sup>, Boris M. van Breukelen<sup>c</sup>, Victor Bense<sup>d</sup>, Petra M. Visser<sup>e</sup>, Erik H. Meesters<sup>f,g</sup>, Paul Koeniger<sup>b</sup>, Mark J.A. Vermeij<sup>e,h,\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Marine Microbiology and Biogeochemistry, Royal Netherlands Institute for Sea Research, P.O. Box 59, 1790 AB Den Burg, Texel, the Netherlands

<sup>b</sup> Federal Institute for Geosciences and Natural Resources (BGR), Stilleweg 2, Hannover, Germany

<sup>c</sup> Delft University of Technology, Faculty of Civil Engineering and Geosciences, Department of Water Management, Stevinweg 1, 2628 CN Delft, the Netherlands

<sup>d</sup> Department of Environmental Sciences, Wageningen University and Research, Droevendaalsesteeg 3a, 6708 PB Wageningen, the Netherlands

<sup>e</sup> Department of Freshwater and Marine Ecology, Institute for Biodiversity and Ecosystem Dynamics, University of Amsterdam, P.O. Box 94240, 1090 GE Amsterdam, the Netherlands

<sup>f</sup> Wageningen Marine Research, Wageningen University and Research, 1781 AG Den Helder, the Netherlands

<sup>g</sup> Aquatic Ecology and Water Quality Management, Wageningen University and Research, 6700 AA Wageningen, the Netherlands

<sup>h</sup> CARMABI Foundation, P.O. Box 2090, Piscaderabaai z/n, Willemstad, Curaçao

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Nutrients Eutrophication Internal waves Deep chlorophyll-a maximum

#### ABSTRACT

This study aimed to identify ocean- and land-based sources of nutrients to the coral reef communities surrounding the Southern Caribbean islands Aruba, Bonaire, and Curaçao (ABC islands). The composition of water masses around these islands were assessed to depths up to 300 m and three distinct overlying water masses were identified, separated by mixing zones. A fluctuating pycnocline separating surface from deeper ( $>\sim$ 50 m) water indicated the presence of internal waves. Nutrient profiles were typical of tropical waters with oligotrophic waters occurring above the pycnocline and a deep chlorophyll-*a* maximum (DCM) just below it (~65 m). Concentrations of dissolved nutrients differed among islands. Inorganic nitrogen (DIN) and phosphate concentrations were respectively lowest around Bonaire and Curaçao. The spatial distribution of chlorophyll-*a* (indicative of phytoplankton biomass), rather than nutrient concentrations, suggested the presence of higher-than-average nutrient concentrations in islands with higher population densities and near urbanized/industrial areas.

#### 1. Introduction

The Caribbean Sea is generally characterized by a distinct stratification of vertically separated water masses whose hydrodynamics, distribution, and composition influence the functioning and composition of nearby coral reef systems (e.g., De'ath and Fabricius, 2010; Fabricius, 2005; Szmant, 2002; Wiedenmann et al., 2013). The upper water layer is comprised of Caribbean Surface Water (CSW) and has a thickness of maximum 100 m and a salinity <35.5 (Casanova-Masjoan et al., 2018; Hernández-Guerra and Joyce, 2000). The CSW layer is well mixed across its depth range and consists of North Atlantic Surface Water mixed with rain and freshwater originating from the South American continent, including the Amazon and Orinoco rivers. Beneath this layer lies the North Atlantic Subtropical Under-Water (SUW) originating from the central tropical Atlantic. SUW is characterized by a vertical salinity maximum (exceeding 37) generally found between depths of 100 and 175 m depending on location in the Caribbean (Correa-Ramirez et al., 2019; Metcalf, 1976; Qu et al., 2016). CSW is generally characterized by lower nitrate concentrations than the SUW (CSW: <1.5 and SUW: 1–8  $\mu$ mol/L, Cervantes-Díaz et al., 2022; Corredor and Morell, 2001). Both CSW and SUW, including the mixing zone between them, influence coastal marine organisms including calcifying corals that are abundant in shallow waters (<60 m) and of which some can occur to depths up to 150 m in Aruba, Bonaire, and Curaçao, i.e., the ABC islands (Frade et al., 2019). Below the SUW, water masses with Atlantic and Antarctic origins (e.g., western North Atlantic Central Water (wNACW), Antarctic Intermediate Water (AAIW)) are found that reach to the bottom and are characterized by specific salinities (35.6–36.7 and 33.8–34.5,

E-mail address: m.j.a.vermeij@uva.nl (M.J.A. Vermeij).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2024.117297

Received 13 March 2024; Received in revised form 11 November 2024; Accepted 11 November 2024 Available online 22 November 2024 0025-326X/© 2024 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author at: Department of Freshwater and Marine Ecology, Institute for Biodiversity and Ecosystem Dynamics, University of Amsterdam, P.O. Box 94240, 1090 GE Amsterdam, the Netherlands.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Present address: EDINSI Groundwater, Rivierahof 6, 1394 DC, Nederhorst den Berg, The Netherlands.

respectively), temperatures ( $\sim$ 8–19 and  $\sim$ 3–5 °C, respectively) and nutrient concentrations that are higher than those of the CSW and SUW (Cervantes-Díaz et al., 2022; Metcalf, 1976; Morrison and Nowlin, 1982).

In an area along the coast of South America roughly bounded by Trinidad in the East and Barranquilla (Colombia) in the West, seasonal upwelling often moves deep nutrient-rich waters towards the surface between December to March and in July (Astor et al., 2003; Castellanos et al., 2002; Correa-Ramirez et al., 2019; Rueda-Roa and Müller-Karger, 2013). Ekman transport causes these upwelled waters to move in a northern direction where they can reach the ABC islands, located <100 km from the South American continent (Bongaerts et al., 2015; Frade et al., 2019; Leichter et al., 2006). Such oceanic influences together with nutrient inputs of terrestrial origins (e.g., poorly, or non-treated domestic sewage, industrial waste) affect the biochemical composition of nearshore waters surrounding these Caribbean islands (DeGeorges et al., 2010; Suchley and Alvarez-Filip, 2018). Land-derived nutrients can also enter the islands' near-shore waters as direct discharge, run-off, and through submarine groundwater discharge (Lapointe et al., 1990; Moosdorf et al., 2015). Resulting nutrient influxes can occur as local and relatively short-lived (hours to days) events after heavy rains or as a more diffuse and chronic process when e.g., sewage infrastructure is permanently damaged (Häder et al., 2020; Wear and Thurber, 2015). Regardless of the mechanism, excess nutrients often alter the functioning of reef communities by benefitting fast-growing organisms such as fleshy algae that then outcompete slower growing organisms such as reef building corals (e.g., Adam et al., 2021; McCook, 1999; McManus and Polsenberg, 2004).

As on many other Caribbean islands, nutrient concentrations have been measured around the ABC islands at relatively shallow depths (<20 m, e.g., Den Haan et al., 2016; Gast et al., 1999; Lapointe and Mallin, 2011; Slijkerman et al., 2014; Van Duyl and Gast, 2001). However, little is known to what degree large-scale intra- and inter-island differences in water composition, including nutrient concentrations, exist, and whether they result from the influx of offshore waterbodies, upwelling and/or terrestrial sources. Such geographical differences in water chemistry composition likely account for some of the spatial differences in reef community composition. In short, it is currently not well known if and to what degree spatial differences in nutrient regimes exist in the ABC islands' offshore waters and, if present, if such spatial differences result from underlying natural (e.g., island mass effects, upwelling) or anthropogenic influences. This study strives to address this information gap by combining shipboard analyses of physical oceanographic parameters, nutrient concentrations, and isotopic signatures to describe the distribution and stratification of water masses surrounding the ABC islands.

#### 2. Studied system and methods

#### 2.1. Island characteristics

The Caribbean islands of Aruba (179 km<sup>2</sup>, 600 persons km<sup>-2</sup> on



Fig. 1. (a) Location of the ABC Islands with sites surveyed in Aruba (a) and maps with sites surveyed at Curaçao (b), and Bonaire (c) with inset indicating stations in the Kralendijk urban area (d). Note that location 12 is not shown as it overlaps with location 8. Main roads are indicated by white lines, the Bonaire salt works are indicated by the light shaded area (data © OpenStreetMap contributors, www.openstreetmap.org). Elevations based on Shuttle Radar Topography Mission data (SRTM) available from the U.S. Geological Survey. AMSL stands for "above mean sea level".

average in 2022, (CBS-AU, 2022)), Bonaire (287 km<sup>2</sup>, 72 persons km<sup>-2</sup> on average in 2020, (CBS-NL, 2020)), and Curaçao (444 km<sup>2</sup>, 335 persons km<sup>-2</sup> on average in 2021, (CBS-CW, 2023)) are often referred to as the ABC Islands (Fig. 1). They are the three western-most islands of the Aruba-La Blanquila chain located 27 (Aruba) to 86 km (Bonaire) north of Venezuela. The ABC islands are generally hilly on their western side, but otherwise relatively flat with maximum elevations of 189 m (Aruba), 241 m (Bonaire), and 375 m (Curaçao). They harbor small beaches and inland bays that formed when former river valleys flooded during sea level rises during the Holocene. Sandy beaches are more pronounced in Aruba and in contrast to the other islands, Aruba's southwestern side is largely flanked by a lagoon.

The geology and hydrogeology of the ABC islands are somewhat comparable. Their coasts are to various degrees comprised of partially karstified, permeable limestone terraces bordering poorly permeable volcanic rock at the islands' centers (Westermann, 1949). Based on limited knowledge of the functioning of karstic aquifers in the ABC islands, groundwater discharge through conduits is expected along the islands' shores and seafloor (Abtmaier, 1978; Hummelinck, 1943; van Sambeek et al., 2000). Groundwater in all islands is slightly brackish due to high evapotranspiration, seawater intrusion due to tidal pumping, and sea spray (van Sambeek et al., 2000). Widespread contamination of groundwater has occurred, especially in built-up areas due to the presence of leaking septic tanks and cesspits (Arboleda and Peachey, 2016; van Sambeek et al., 2000).

#### 2.2. Climate

Mean monthly sea water temperatures range between 27 °C in March and 29 °C in September/October (Skirving et al., 2020). Rainfall foremost occurs between September to January but is highly variable among years and across each island (DMA, 2019; MDC, 2023). Average annual rainfall is lowest in Aruba (470 mm) followed by Bonaire (490 mm), and Curaçao (550 mm, Schmutz et al., 2017). All islands experience sustained moderate easterly trade wind resulting in waves up to 3.5 m along the windward (northern and eastern) shores of the islands throughout the year, while the leeward (southern and western) shores of the islands experience wave heights of <1 m (Van Duyl, 1985). The ABC islands lie just outside the hurricane belt.

#### 2.3. Local currents

Aruba is, contrary to Bonaire and Curacao, not separated from the Venezuelan continent by the Bonaire Basin, and part of the Venezuelan continental flat (Van den Oever, 2000). The maximum water depth between Aruba and the Venezuelan peninsula is <190 m but around 1500 m for the oceanic islands Curaçao and Bonaire. The Caribbean Current, forced by the eastern trade winds, is the major ocean current influencing the ABC islands (Wüst, 1963). It transports Atlantic Ocean water through the Grenada, St. Vincent, and St. Lucia Passages in a westward direction along the coast of South America towards the Gulf Stream (Centurioni and Niiler, 2003). While moving westward along the South American continent, the Caribbean Current receives an influx of fresh water from various rivers, including the Amazon and the Orinoco (Chérubin and Richardson, 2007). While highly variable, the overall mean velocity of the Caribbean Current near the ABC islands is estimated at 70 cm/s with higher values reported up to 123 cm/s (Fratantoni, 2001; Gyory et al., 2009).

#### 3. General data collection

All data were collected between January 25 and February 2, 2018 from the oceanographic research vessel *Pelagia* as part of the Netherlands Initiative Changing Oceans (NICO) expedition (Leg 3, expedition number 64PE430). The water column was sampled at 8 sites in Bonaire and Curaçao and 2 sites in Aruba to produce a biochemical

and physical descriptions of water bodies located  $\sim 250$  to 1500 m offshore (farther in Aruba due to shallow bathymetry) and across their entire depth range (range: 60–300 m; Fig. 1). The site near Bonaire's capital Kralendijk (Fig. 1d) encompassed a zone of  $\sim 2.5$  km along shore where 6 additional stations were sampled either late afternoon (stations 6, 10) or at sunrise (stations 4, 8, 12, 15, note that station 8 and 12 are overlapping stations in Fig. 1). Given their proximity to one another, these additional stations were, together with station 2 (sampled late afternoon), considered as one "site" to investigate the presence of short-term changes in water quality and stratification between January 26 (3:20 pm, local time) to January 30 (6:43 am), 2018. The 6 additional stations were not used for inter-island comparisons in water column characteristics.

#### 3.1. Physical characteristics of the water column

At each station the potential temperature, salinity, water density, light transmission, and chlorophyll-*a* fluorescence were measured across the entire water column by lowering a CTD package from the surface to a few meters above the seafloor. The CTD package comprised a Seabird CTD (SBE9plus), a SBE11plusV2 deck unit, a water sampler carousel (SBE32) connected to a pump (SBE5T), a thermometer (SBE3plus), a conductivity sensor (SBE4), a dissolved oxygen sensor (SBE43), a fluorometer (Chelsea Aquatracka MKIII), a transmissometer (Wetlabs C-Star, 25 cm path length, 650 nm), and an in water photosynthetic active radiation (PAR) sensor that was used in combination with a ship based PAR sensor (Satlantic logarithmic) to determine light extinction with increasing depth. pH was measured in water samples (see below) using a Schott Gerate CG840 pH meter and a Schott blue line 15 electrode that were calibrated using three buffer solutions of pH = 4.01, 7.00 and 10.00 (Certipur). The density of seawater was calculated using the TEOS-10 method (Pawlowicz, 2010).

#### 3.2. Water characteristics

At each site, water samples from different depths were analyzed for nutrient concentrations (PO<sub>4</sub>, NH<sub>4</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>x</sub>, i.e., NO<sub>3</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub> combined), <sup>222</sup>Rn (indicative of groundwater influx) and <sup>18</sup>O and <sup>2</sup>H (indicative of the water's geographic origin). Water samples were collected at depths between 3 and 59 to 280 m using a Rosette sampling frame with 24 twelve-liter Niskin sampling bottles (Ocean Test Equipment) that were mounted on the CTD package. Before taking each water sample, Niskin bottles were flushed at each sampling depth for at least 1 min to ensure a representative in-situ sample was collected.

To determine the concentration of <sup>222</sup>Rn isotopes, a sample was obtained by placing a glass bottle (597 mL) inside a larger glass container overflowing with water from the Niskin bottle containing seawater of a specific depth. The bottle was then capped underwater to prevent radon loss to the atmosphere. The sample was equilibrated with a known volume of air in a closed loop system for 30 min, followed by three measurement cycles lasting 30 min each. Radon activity was quantified using alpha-spectroscopy (SARAD EQF3220) capable of detecting radon concentrations >0.02 Bq/L (SARAD GmbH, 2007). Water samples to determine the concentration of stable water isotopes (<sup>18</sup>O and <sup>2</sup>H) were collected separately in glass vials that were stored at 4 °C on board for analysis at BGR, Hannover, Germany using a cavity ring-down laser spectrometer (PICARRO L2120-i). Reported values represent the mean of at least four individual measurements from each sample. Raw data were checked for organic contamination using ChemCorrect and corrected for memory effects, drift, and normalized to the VSMOW/SLAP scale (Nelson, 2000). All values are given in delta notation per mil (‰) vs. V-SMOW (Vienna Standard Mean Ocean Water). Reproducibility, measured as the standard deviation of a quality control standard, was better than 0.8 % and 0.20 % for  $\delta^2$ H and  $\delta^{18}$ O, respectively.

On board, subsamples from the Niskin bottles were collected for

nutrient analyses using 60 ml HDPE syringes after three rinses with the sampled water. Nutrient samples were filtered (pore size: 0.8 followed by 0.2 µm) and filtrates were stored in three times pre-rinsed glass vials in the dark at 4 °C until they were analyzed on board within 12 h. Nutrient concentrations were determined using a Gas Segmented Continuous Flow Analyzer (QuAAtro) using individual channels for PO<sub>4</sub>, NH<sub>4</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>x</sub> following the GO-SHIP protocol (Hydes et al., 2010). Stock-standards low nutrient seawater (LNSW from OSIL batch LNS 21) with the same salinity as the samples were diluted in filtered (0.2  $\mu$ m) seawater and used for calibration prior to all measurements (Hydes et al., 2010). Detection limits for PO<sub>4</sub>, NH<sub>4</sub>, NO<sub>3</sub>, and NO<sub>2</sub> were 0.02, 0.04, 0.015, and 0.001 µmol/L, respectively. Precision among repeated measurements on the same sample was high and variation among replicate samples ranged between 0.7 and 1.2 %. All nutrient analyses were conducted in a containerized temperature-controlled laboratory on board the RV Pelagia within 12 h after sampling. Average DIN: DIP ratios were calculated for each sample by dividing the concentration of dissolved inorganic nitrogen (DIN, i.e. NH<sub>4</sub> and NO<sub>x</sub>) by the concentration of dissolved inorganic phosphate (DIP, i.e. PO<sub>4</sub>). The salinity of the surface water ( $\sim$ 3–5 m depth) was constantly measured while the Pelagia was in transit using a shipboard CTD (Aqua Flow system, Seabird SBE 21). Where relevant, nutrient concentrations and ratios are reported as means  $\pm$  SD. SPSS 28 (IBM Corp., 2021) was used to assess potential differences among sampling locations and depths.

#### 4. Results

#### 4.1. General water column characteristics

Depth profiles for salinity (S), potential temperature ( $\theta$ ), and density  $(\sigma_{\theta})$  are shown in Fig. 2 for each island. On Bonaire and Curaçao (Fig. 2a, b), a well-mixed  ${\sim}50$  m thick surface layer was observed with S and  $\theta$ values mostly typical of CSW during the rainy season, i.e., ~36 and 27 °C. This water layer appeared slightly less thick in Aruba, where only two sites were sampled (Fig. 2c). Below the CSW, a zone occurred where salinity concentrations increased with depth, indicating the presence of a halocline. This zone ended around 80 m on Bonaire and Curaçao, and at  $\sim$ 50 m depth in Aruba. Below these depths, water layer characteristics approached values typically reported for SUW, i.e., S =  $\sim\!37$  and  $\theta=$ 22 °C. The depth of the top of the shallow pycnocline, i.e., the transition zone with the greatest density gradient between the well-mixed CSW and underlying SUW waters, defined as the depth where the density increases by >0.05 kg/m<sup>3</sup> over a 1 m depth interval, varied depending on sampling location and time. The pycnocline occurred between  $\sim$ 33 and 60 m depth in Bonaire, between ~43 and 68 m in Curaçao, and between  $\sim$ 21 and 45 m in Aruba (Fig. 2). The decline in S and  $\theta$  with depth in the SUW layer suggests mechanical turbulent mixing with an underlying layer starting just below 300 m, most likely wNACW based on the physical definitions for these water masses from nearby Colombia (wNACW: ~36, ~13 °C, Correa-Ramirez et al., 2019).

Differences in the depth profiles of salinity, temperature, and density measured during our study appeared more pronounced among rather than within islands, with the exception of station 14, located on the northeastern side of Bonaire (Figs. 1, 2a). The salinity of the surface water at this station was relatively low (~35.45), and its halocline was characterized by relatively high temperatures (up to 28 °C, Fig. 2a). In the potential temperature-salinity diagram (Fig. 3) station 14 (the only sampled site on Bonaire's windward shore) deviated from all other stations in Bonaire and other islands whose water masses showed a comparable relationship between potential temperature and salinity. Stations at the exposed tips (16, 22, 24) and one exposed station along Bonaire's leeward coast (11) are also shown in Fig. 3 as open symbols (similar to station 14) to visualize potential differences between stations along the islands' wind- and leeward coasts. Somewhat similar to station 14, the average salinity in the surface layer (i.e., <50 m) in Aruba was higher (though the temperature lower) compared to the other two

islands (Fig. 2). A general increase in surface water salinity from east (Bonaire) to west (Aruba) was also found from continuous shipboard measurements (~3–5 m depth, Fig. 4) and likely indicates a decreasing influence of freshwater input from South American rivers when moving in a westerly direction in the area under investigation.

#### 4.2. Isotopes

No significant influxes of terrestrial groundwater were observed as the concentration of <sup>222</sup>Radon isotopes in water samples along Curaçao and Bonaire between 4 and 250 m depth were all below the detection limit.  $\delta^2$ H and  $\delta^{18}$ O values (Fig. 5) indicated depth specific differences in isotopic enrichment relative to V-SMOW ( $\delta^2 H = 0.0 \%$ ;  $\delta^{18} O = 0.0 \%$ ). Increases in  $\delta^2$ H and  $\delta^{18}$ O coincided with increases in salinity (Fig. 5a, b) and are typical for tropical environments with high evaporation rates. Surface layer waters were characterized by salinities as low as 35.60 and by isotopic values of 5  $\% < \delta^2 H < 7 \%$  and 0.6  $\% < \delta^{18} O < 1 \%$  (cf. Fig. 5a, b). With increasing depth surface water often became mixed with SUW resulting in salinities up to 36.95 and isotopic values of 6 % <  $\delta^2 H < 8$  ‰ and 0.8 ‰  $< \delta^{18} O < 1.1$  ‰. SUW also mixed with an underlying water mass and based on extrapolation, this deeper water was characterized by salinities <35.85, and isotopic values of  $\delta^2 H < 3.5$  ‰. and  $\delta^{18}O < 0.55$  ‰ suggesting mixing of SUW with deeper Atlantic waters (e.g., wNACW, Fig. 3).

For comparison, two known relationships between  $\delta^{18}O$  and salinity from elsewhere in the Caribbean Sea have been plotted in Fig. 5b, one from Puerto Rico (Watanabe et al., 2001) and one from Venezuela (McConnell et al., 2009). Only the seawater in the mixed surface layer and near the halocline at station 12 deviated from the general patterns in Caribbean water stratification described for Puerto Rico, Venezuela, and all other stations included in this study. Station 12 was characterized by relatively low  $\delta^{18}O$  values that showed no correlation with salinity, and its average  $\delta^2H$  value was relatively high (Fig. 5). We are not aware of any process that would explain this observation, though this site was close to a man-made canal system that could have affected our observations at this station.

#### 4.3. Nutrient concentrations

The distribution of nutrients showed a relatively consistent general pattern across depth among all sampled stations (Table 1, Fig. 6). Average NO3 and PO4 concentrations were lowest and relatively constant within the mixed surface layer (~0.15 and ~0.03  $\mu$ mol/L, respectively). Below the mixed surface layer (i.e.,  $>\sim$  50 m), NO<sub>3</sub> and PO<sub>4</sub> concentrations increased (linearly) with depth over the entire depth range sampled (Fig. 6). NH<sub>4</sub> concentrations were relatively stable across depth (Table 1, Fig. 6) though higher concentrations of NH<sub>4</sub> were observed locally in the mixed surface layer (i.e., station 7 in Bonaire, 0.479 µmol/L, not shown in Fig. 6a). NH<sub>4</sub> concentrations decreased slightly below  $\sim$ 70 m to average concentrations of <0.09  $\mu$ mol/L (Fig. 6). NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations were low at the surface ( $\sim 0.02 \,\mu mol/L$ ) and increased with depth to 60-70 m ( $\sim$ 0.08 µmol/L) after which they declined towards greater depths and became stable at depths greater than  $\sim$ 150 m ( $\sim$ 0.01 µmol/L, Fig. 6). The increased abundance of NO<sub>2</sub> around 60-70 m was most pronounced in Bonaire. In the surface layer (<50 m), average PO<sub>4</sub> concentrations were lower in Curaçao compared to Bonaire (Dunn-Test, p < 0.05), NH<sub>4</sub> concentrations in Curaçao were lower compared to Bonaire and Aruba (Dunn-Test, p < 0.01), whereas NO3 and NO2 concentrations were higher in Aruba compared to Curaçao and Bonaire (Dunn-Test, p < 0.01, Table 1). Average DIN:DIP ratios in the islands' surface waters (<50 m depth) were lowest in Bonaire (8.1  $\pm$ 4.9), and different from those in Curaçao (21.3  $\pm$  27.4) and Aruba (24.8  $\pm$  10.3, Dunn-Test, p < 0.05). DIN:DIP ratios in Bonaire increased to values of  $\sim 18$  with depth (to  $\sim 65$  m), similar to values observed in shallower waters in Curaçao and Aruba. Below ~65 m DIN:DIP ratios were constant in all islands across the depth range sampled (i.e., in the



**Fig. 2.** Salinity (*S*), potential temperature ( $\theta$ ), and density ( $\sigma\theta$ ) of water masses sampled using CTD casts at (a) Bonaire, (b) Curaçao, and (c) Aruba. Only the first 300 m are shown, values represent averages of 1 m depth intervals. The numbers of the stations that are discussed in the text are indicated in (a). Arrows with numbers point to the lines of the stations near Kralendijk (8, 10 and 12) that showed the largest vertical shift in the salinity profile and to station 14, which is discussed in detail in the main text.



**Fig. 3.** Potential temperature ( $\theta$ ) versus salinity (S) diagram. Stations on the leeward side of the islands are shown as closed symbols and on the windward side and more exposed sites as open symbols. The presence of the Caribbean Surface Water (CSW), North Atlantic Subtropical Under-Water (SUW), and western North Atlantic Central Waters (wNACW) is indicated by their abbreviations. The black line is the  $\sigma_{\theta} = 25.4 \text{ kg/m}^3$  isopycnal between  $36.8 \le S \le 37$  along which Subtropical Under Water sinks in deeper waters from the central Atlantic (Hernández-Guerra and Joyce, 2000).

SUW, Fig. 6). Across the entire dataset, NO<sub>3</sub> and PO<sub>4</sub> concentrations were highly correlated (Pearson's r: 0.99, p < 0.01, n = 142). Significant general correlations among other nutrient concentrations were negative and less pronounced (PO<sub>4</sub> – NH<sub>4</sub>: Pearson's r: -0.32, p < 0.01, NO<sub>3</sub> – NH<sub>4</sub>: Pearson's r: -0.26, p < 0.01, n = 142–144).

The average daytime DIN concentration in Bonaire (0.258  $\pm$  0.207) was not different (Mann-Whitney *U* Test, *p* = 0.77) compared to that of the surface waters around the more densely populated island Curaçao (0.262  $\pm$  0.187 µmol/L). The most densely populated island, Aruba, had the highest average DIN concentrations in its surface waters (Table 1, Dunn-Test, *p* < 0.05), whereas average PO<sub>4</sub> concentrations were lowest in Curaçao (Table 1, Dunn-Test, *p* < 0.05). When exposed stations, i.e., those exposed to the trade wind driven waves (stations 14, 16, 21, 22, 24), were compared to all other stations along the islands' leeward shores no differences in nutrient concentrations for the 3 depth zones (Table 1) could be detected (Mann-Whitney *U* Test, *p* > 0.31).

#### 4.4. Chlorophyll-a

Chlorophyll-*a* (Chl-*a*) distributions across depth differed among islands (Fig. 7). In Bonaire, most Chl-*a* profiles showed a gradual increase with depth in the mixed surface layer followed by a steep increase below the top of the pycnocline, i.e., around  $\sim 60$  m, representing the deep chlorophyll-*a* maximum (DCM, Fig. 7a). The DCM coincided with

the highest concentrations of NO2 across the depth range sampled (Fig. 6). Below the DCM, Chl-a concentrations decreased with depth, to  $<0.2 \mu g/L$  below 100 m depth (Fig. 7). Because the DCM occurred near the end of euphotic zone (around  $\sim 63$  m), light limitation at depths greater than  $\sim 63$  m likely caused the decrease in Chl-a concentrations below the DCM. Average Chl-a concentrations in the mixed surface layer are higher in Curaçao and Aruba compared to Bonaire (Dunn-Test, p < 0.05). This difference was foremost caused by a high abundance of Chl-a between depths of 0 to ~50 m at some of Curaçao's leeward side, e.g., stations 19 and 23 which correspond to respectively a watershed harboring the island's landfill and the opening of the Schottegat where Curaçao's capital, harbor, and refinery are located (Sandin et al., 2022). The DCM at these three sites was also less pronounced (Fig. 7b). The general high abundance of Chl-a measured at the 2 stations in Aruba (Fig. 7c) is likely the result of the island's thinner mixed surface layer (Fig. 2c), caused by the island's shallow bathymetry (Fig. 1) or its closer proximity to upwelling areas along the South American mainland (Rueda-Roa and Müller-Karger, 2013).

Chl-*a* concentrations are often used to identify areas experiencing nutrient pollution, i.e., eutrophication. While threshold values are often debated, we assumed a conservative eutrophication threshold of  $0.2 \,\mu$ g/L for tropical marine ecosystems (following e.g., Bell et al., 2014) to assess whether signs of eutrophication were present at certain stations. Based on this assumption, widespread eutrophication of the mixed



Fig. 4. Seawater salinity measured by the shipboard equipment of the R/V Pelagia between 28 January and 2 February 2018. Source of bathymetry data htt p://www.dcbd.nl/document/bathymetry-map-seas-surrounding-aruba-bonaire-and-Curaçao (accessed on 9 October 2018).

surface layer (CSW) was found, i.e., in Bonaire at stations 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 10, 13 and 14, along the SW coast of Curaçao, from station 23 (outlet main harbor) downstream to stations 1, 19, 17, 16, and in Aruba (stations 24, 25, Fig. 7).

The limit of the photic zone, i.e., where sun light reaches 1 % of its value at the surface was on average deepest in Bonaire (63 m  $\pm$  8 SD) and decreased towards Curaçao (57 m  $\pm$  7 SD) and Aruba (47 m  $\pm$  11 SD) based on measurements taken during our cruise.

#### 4.5. Spatio-temporal variation in water composition near Kralendijk

Based on repeated measurements taken in the mixed surface layer at nearby stations (all near Kralendijk, the capital of Bonaire, Fig. 1d), a simultaneous thinning of the mixed surface layer, upward movement of the thermocline and widening of the halocline was observed whereby the DCM followed the upward movement of the pycnocline (Fig. 8). The pycnocline rose from ~55 to ~34 m depth between January 26 (pm) and January 29 (am), followed by a drop of ~14 m on January 29 and 30 (Fig. 8). The upward movement of the pycnocline caused increases in Chl-*a* in shallower waters and likely also in nutrient concentrations as water from depths just below 50 m had higher nutrient concentrations (except  $NH_4^+$ ) compared to shallower water masses at this location (Table 1).

#### 5. Discussion

#### 5.1. General water column characteristics around the ABC islands

The shallow waters (i.e., above the pycnocline) around the ABC islands had a relatively low salinity and high temperature (Fig. 2) typical of the westward flowing Caribbean current in this area (Johns et al., 2002). Beneath the surface layer, Subtropical Under-Water (SUW) was found, which was characterized as water with a salinity S > 37 along the 25.4 isopycnal in the  $\theta$ -*S* diagram (Fig. 3). This pattern of stratification is consistent with observations for water of South Atlantic origin from the nearby coasts of Venezuela (Hernández-Guerra and Joyce, 2000) and

Colombia (Correa-Ramirez et al., 2019). Spatial differences in water composition within and among islands were foremost evident in the surface layer (i.e.,  $<\sim$ 50 m) as data collected with CTD casts showed largely similar water for the SUW (e.g., the same  $\theta$ -*S* pattern) around all islands. The presence of distinct mixing regimes based on the stable water isotope data (i.e., of surface water and SUW, and SUW and South Atlantic water, Fig. 5) was consistent with the presence of these three water types. While isotope studies to date have focused primarily on <sup>18</sup>O isotopes as a proxy for paleo-seawater conditions (Jentzen et al., 2018; McConnell et al., 2009), the clear depth dependent relationship between  $\delta^2$ H and S (Fig. 5) suggests that <sup>2</sup>H could also be a suitable tracer for Atlantic waters in the Caribbean Sea in addition to other tracers like chlorinated fluorocarbons (Joyce et al., 2001).

#### 5.2. Spatial variation in water mass composition and stratification

On the leeward side of Bonaire, the water column above the pycnocline was characterized by a uniform salinity and temperature (Fig. 2a). However, at the more exposed tips/sides of the island and particularly the windward, northern side, the surface waters, particularly station 14, showed an increased resemblance to the Caribbean Surface Water (CSW) found north of 13°N as indicated by the open symbols in the  $\theta$ -S diagram (Fig. 3). To a lesser extent this was also the case for Curaçao suggesting that both islands are located near the southern boundary of the CSW. Locally higher salinities compared to typical values observed for CSW suggest that both islands are in close proximity to the Southern Caribbean Upwelling System (Torres et al., 2023). The systematic increase in salinity of the surface water towards the west around the islands confirms the presence of a salinity gradient in the southern Caribbean Sea caused by the decreasing influence of freshwater runoff from the South American continent, especially the resulting from the Orinoco River (Andrade and Barton, 2005; Chollett et al., 2012). This river's outflow is greatest near the end of the rainy season (Torres et al., 2023), i.e., during our cruise in January, and salinities increase is a westward direction due to horizontal and vertical mixing and by local air-sea fluxes (Jury, 2018; Müller-Karger et al.,



Fig. 5. (a) The relationship between  $\delta^2$ H and (b)  $\delta^{18}$ O values and seawater salinity. Salinity was derived from the CTD casts. Vertical error bars represent the standard deviation of the isotope measurement, horizontal error bars are the standard deviation of the salinity measurement (representing the variability encountered during the time it took to flush the Niskin bottles). The lines in (b) represent the regression line for (I) surface seawater water samples at Puerto Rico reported by Watanabe et al. (2001) and (II) samples up to 250 m depth in the Cariaco Basin (Venezuela) in February 2006 reported by McConnell et al. (2009). The values of station 12 are encircled by dotted lines. Symbols:  $\circ$  Curaçao;  $\Delta$  Bonaire/Kralendijk;  $\checkmark$  Bonaire other stations;  $\Box$  Aruba.

Fable 1
Nater masses categorized by island and depth zone with characteristics of their nutrient concentrations.

Island	Depth zone	PO <sub>4 (</sub> µmol/L)		NH <sub>4 (</sub> µmol/L)		NO <sub>2 (</sub> µmol/L)		NO <sub>3</sub> (µmol/L)		DIN:DIP	
		Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
Aruba	0–50 m	0.05	0.06	0.13	0.02	0.03	0.03	0.92	1.18	24.75	10.34
Aruba	51–100 m	0.30	0.08	0.11	0.01	0.03	0.01	5.74	1.19	20.08	1.24
Aruba	101–300 m	0.71	0.20	0.09	0.01	0.02	0.00	12.90	3.03	18.34	0.91
Bonaire	0–50 m	0.03	0.01	0.12	0.05	0.01	0.03	0.12	0.17	8.09	4.94
Bonaire	51–100 m	0.11	0.06	0.10	0.02	0.10	0.04	1.70	1.23	16.47	3.17
Bonaire	101–300 m	0.70	0.32	0.09	0.03	0.02	0.01	11.99	5.17	17.69	0.83
Curaçao	0–50 m	0.02	0.01	0.09	0.02	0.00	0.00	0.17	0.18	21.26	27.35
Curaçao	51–100 m	0.16	0.11	0.09	0.02	0.04	0.02	2.91	2.07	19.02	2.27
Curaçao	101–300 m	0.63	0.29	0.07	0.02	0.01	0.01	10.91	4.66	17.87	0.73

#### 1989; Torres et al., 2023).

In Aruba, the surface water layer was not as clearly identifiable as along Bonaire and Curaçao, and SUW was already present at depths <60 m possibly. The shallower bathymetry separating Aruba from the South

American continent likely promotes vertical mixing of water masses around the island relative to Curaçao and Bonaire that are surrounded by deep oceanic water (Fig. 1).



**Fig. 6.** Nutrient ( $NH_4$ ,  $NO_3$ ,  $NO_2$ , and  $PO_4$ ) concentrations and DIN:DIP ratios (N:P) versus depth for all stations. The high concentration of  $NH_4$  (0.479  $\mu$ mol/L) at 5 m depth at station 7 is not shown. Colors denote the individual islands, with the samples taken offshore Kralendijk on Bonaire indicated separately. The number between parentheses in the legend indicates the number of stations per color category. Open symbols denote stations occurring in windward or exposed locations, whereas closed symbols are for stations located on the leeward side of the islands.



Fig. 7. Depth profiles of chlorophyll-*a* concentration on basis of daytime fluorescence measurements. (a) Bonaire (between 12:00 and 20:00 h LT), (b) Curaçao (between 7:00 and 19:00 h LT), and (c) Aruba (between 7:00–14:00 h LT). For the location of station numbers see Fig. 1. A thin vertical line indicates a Chl-a concentration of  $0.2 \mu g/L$  used as an eutrophication threshold in this study.

#### 5.3. Variations in stratification and undulations of the pycnocline

Haloclines, thermoclines, and pycnoclines were always found in the transition layer from the mixed surface layer (CSW) to the SUW, i.e., between depths of  $\sim$ 30 and 75 m depending on location and date of sampling. Variation in depths at which the composition of water in the

first 100 m of the water column changes can be caused by local differences in bathymetry and oceanic processes such as internal waves (tidal waves, upwelling, Hernández-Guerra and Joyce, 2000; Leichter et al., 2006). The latter authors estimated the area's frequency of internal waves at ~0.5 cycles per day based on temperature time series data collected at Bonaire at a depth of 30 m. The internal wave that passed



**Fig. 8.** Depth profiles for Chl-*a* concentrations near Kralendijk between January 26 and 30, 2018. The circles mark the depth of the top of the pycnocline. The area indicated in grey denotes the approximate depth below which certain nutrient concentrations at this site are elevated compared to shallower (<50 m) waters (see Table 1).

Kralendijk, Bonaire from 26 to 30 January (Fig. 8) undulated at an estimated  $\sim$ 0.2 cycles per day and moved the pycnocline from 55 to 34 m depth. These internal waves could underlie the reported short-lasting temperature drops of approximately 0.5–1 °C (and up to 3 °C) that occur year round at depths of around 50 m on reefs at the leeward side of Curacao and Bonaire (Bak et al., 2005: Bongaerts et al., 2015: Gast et al., 1998; Leichter et al., 2006; Vermeij and Bak, 2003). With subsurface waves, the SUW also carries nutrient rich waters (Fig. 6) higher up into the photic zone supplying primary producers with NO<sub>3</sub> and PO<sub>4</sub>, probably enhancing primary production in mixed surface water down to ~40–75 m depth (~1 % of surface irradiation/incident light). This structuring effect of upwelling on algal communities on coral reefs has also been reported from nearby Colombia (Diaz-Pulido and Garzon-Ferreira, 2002). In Bonaire and Curaçao, the shallower section of this depth range (around  $\sim$ 40 m depth) was historically locally dominated by dense communities of the brown algae Lobophora (Van den Hoek et al., 1978; Van den Hoek et al., 1975). The (historical) absence of this species in shallower reef sections could have been limited by the availability of nutrients brought up from deeper waters by upwelling and internal waves. If upward transport of nutrients does not occur, they appear to support a dense phytoplankton community at depths around ~70 m as evidenced by the occurrence of the DCM at these depths (Fig. 7).

#### 5.4. Nutrients and chlorophyll-a

Nutrient profiles (particularly NO<sub>3</sub> and PO<sub>4</sub>) around the ABC islands measured during our cruise were typical for (sub)tropical oligotrophic waters with nutrient limitation of primary producers in the mixed surface water layer and a DCM below the top of the pycnocline. Profiles at Aruba slightly differed from this general pattern in that nutrient and Chl*a* concentrations were higher compared to Curaçao and Bonaire suggesting a more eutrophied status (Table 1, Figs. 6 and 7). From the pycnocline downwards nutrient concentrations of NO<sub>3</sub> and PO<sub>4</sub> increased around all islands. The increase in nitrite just below pycnocline (nitrite concentrations >0.04 µmol/L) most likely resulted from light limitation of phytoplankton in the DCM leading to a surplus of NH<sub>4</sub>, (through mineralization), which is used by nitrifiers that oxidize NH<sub>4</sub> to NO<sub>2</sub> (Zakem et al., 2018).

#### 5.5. Evidence for local eutrophication?

DIN and PO<sub>4</sub> concentrations in mixed surface waters (CSW) measured offshore remained below some commonly proposed threshold values of eutrophication (1.0 and 0.1 µmol/L respectively) (e.g., Bell et al., 2007). Nutrient measurements taken in shallower (<18 m) water closer to shore and above reef systems in the past often exceeded these same threshold values (e.g., Gast et al., 1999; Gast et al., 1998; Lapointe and Mallin, 2011). These authors reported DIN concentrations of  $\sim 1$ µmol/L or more in 1994/1995 and from 2006 to 2008 along the leeward coasts of Curaçao and Bonaire, often close to areas with dense coastal development. From 2011 to 2013 Slijkerman et al. (2014) found DIN concentrations  $>1 \mu mol/L$  along the reef drop off (~5–17 m depth) in Bonaire often related to coastal-based pollution near the island's capital. In contrast, PO<sub>4</sub> concentrations in Curaçao and Bonaire have only exceeded eutrophication thresholds in a few sites in the past (e.g., Gast et al., 1999; Gast et al., 1998; Slijkerman et al., 2014). PO<sub>4</sub> concentrations along Bonaire were on average higher than along more densely populated Curaçao, similar to observations made in 2006-2008 by Lapointe and Mallin (2011).

General differences among the islands in reef condition could be related to differences in DIN/DIP ratios. DIN:DIP ratios were lowest (mean 6.3  $\pm$  2.2) in Bonaire, the island with the highest average coral cover at 10 m depth, i.e., 21 % (de Bakker et al., 2019). Average DIN:DIP ratios were  $\sim$ 3 times higher on the other islands (range: 14–19) and exceeded values needed for productive coral growth (Wiedenmann et al., 2013). The mean abundance of corals on these islands is also lower than in Bonaire, i.e. 16 % for Curacao (Sandin et al., 2022) and 6 % for Aruba (Vermeij et al., 2019). High DIN:DIP ratios in the CSW in Aruba and Curaçao suggest ineffective N sanitation (removal of inorganic N by nitrification and denitrification through sewage treatment) and/or more profound nitrogen influx via submarine groundwater discharge. In a comparison of groundwater composition among the ABC islands, van Sambeek et al. (2000) reported a considerably lower median NO<sub>3</sub> concentration at Bonaire than at Curaçao (74 vs. 494 µmol/L, respectively, data not available for Aruba). Possible occurrence of submarine groundwater discharge carrying less nitrate to coastal water bodies in Bonaire compared to Curaçao could explain the observed differences in DIN:DIP ratios between these islands, though P concentrations in the ground water of both islands remain presently unknown. In contrast to measurements taken closer to shore, and while our survey period was short and threshold values can be considered subjective, the fact that we did not encounter DIN concentrations exceeding aforementioned threshold values in the more offshore surface waters around the ABC islands (ranges: 0.104-0.762 and 0.002-0.039 µmol/L respectively) strongly suggests that nutrient enrichment (e.g., from terrestrial sources) foremost affects the waters (and organisms therein) close to shore and quickly dissipates as one moves farther offshore, either through usage by benthic and water column organisms or offshore advection.

Locations characterized by high DIN concentrations included

locations with developed shorelines. Examples include station 7 (0.527  $\mu$ mol/L, Wecua Point, Bonaire) located west of a large inland bay (Goto) and an oil transshipment terminal, stations 19 and 23 located respectively near the outlets of watershed harboring the island's landfill and a large, industrialized harbor located in the center of Curaçao's capital Willemstad (0.433  $\mu$ mol/L, Sandin et al., 2022) and station 25 in Aruba located near beaches with dense tourist infrastructure (0.762  $\mu$ mol/L, Vermeij et al., 2019).

# 5.6. Chl-a rather than nutrient concentrations indicate local eutrophication

While inorganic nutrient concentrations often remained below threshold values indicating eutrophication, Chl-a concentrations commonly exceeded the applied eutrophication threshold of 0.20  $\mu$ g/L. Chl-a concentrations exceeding this threshold value were observed in the surface waters at stations in the vicinity and downstream of the main urbanized areas in Curaçao and Bonaire, near the oil transshipment terminal on Bonaire and in Aruba. Areas characterized by high Chl-a concentrations appear consistent through time as previous studies also found high Chl-a concentrations (>0.40 µg/L) near the same (urbanized) areas in 1994 (Van Duyl et al., 2002) and in 2006 and 2008 (Lapointe and Mallin, 2011). Combined, these and our study suggest that increases in phytoplankton (indicated by high Chl-*a* concentrations) can arise rapidly through local land-based processes. The rapid uptake by nutrients and subsequent increase in phytoplankton abundance has been confirmed for the main harbor entrance in Curaçao (Van Duyl et al., 2002) which shows that "eutrophication" should be cautiously defined (or measured) as "unnatural increases in nutrient concentrations" only as these concentrations can decrease when passing phytoplankton communities take up these nutrients to grow. Waterbodies with high phytoplankton abundance could of course move depending on local hydrodynamics and arrive in areas where the causes that led to their formation are no longer present. This would complicate the interpretation of the interaction between land-based forms of pollution (or lack thereof) and the composition of near shore water bodies in such places. Land-based forms of pollution commonly result in local increases in Chl-a concentrations that generally decrease with increasing distance from shore (e.g., Torregroza-Espinosa et al., 2021) including in Bonaire and Curaçao (Lapointe and Mallin, 2011). This would suggest that most excess nutrients entering the ocean through land-based forms of pollution in our study system are rapidly taken up by coastal phytoplankton and algae (Corredor, 1979; den Haan et al., 2016). Rather than by increases of their abundance in the water column, the higher than natural presence of nutrients therefore foremost appeared as increases in the abundance of their consumers, i.e., phytoplankton (using Chl-a abundance as a proxy), and fleshy algae that have increased in abundance in Curaçao and Bonaire over recent decades (Jackson et al., 2013).

The daytime increase in Chl-a abundance with depth in the mixed surface layer and its steep increase towards the DCM around 50 to 65 m depth and subsequent drop to  $<0.2 \mu g/L$  at 80–90 m depth (Fig. 7) can result from changes in phytoplankton physiology (e.g., fluorescence yield, photoadaptation) or net population growth, which includes grazing by zooplankton (Campbell and Vaulot, 1993; Marra, 1997; Moeller et al., 2019). Chlorophyll-a profiles based on in vivo fluorescence must therefore be interpreted with some caution, but it is interesting to note the temporal increase in Chl-a and nitrate concentrations in the mixed surface water in front of Kralendijk between January 26 and 30 (Fig. 8). The increased abundance of Chl-a and nitrate coincided with the passing of a large amplitude, low frequency internal wave, as suggested from the  $\sim 21$  m upward movement of the pycnocline over a  $\sim$ 3-day period (Fig. 8). Shoaling of internal waves between Bonaire and a nearby small island (Klein Bonaire) and between Aruba and Venezuela are likely given the shallow depths of the water masses that separate them (i.e., ~90 and ~190 m depth, respectively). The passage of an internal wave can have increased the availability of nutrients in the

photic zone, directly by nutrient enhanced upwelled water and/or the concentration of land-derived nutrients in a now thinner surface layer. Between Bonaire and Klein Bonaire smooth gently sloping sandy plains are present at depths where the DCM occurs. The seafloor here is covered by extensive and dense meadows of benthic cyanobacteria (Becking and Meesters, 2014) and on shallow reefs the supply of organic (algal) matter is known to stimulate the growth and extension of these cyanobacterial mats (Brocke et al., 2015; Ford et al., 2018). Analogously, the high abundance of organic material associated with the DCM could provide an explanation for the high abundance of cyanobacterial mats that are present at these sites. This example again illustrates how differences in water stratification in combination with local bathymetry can shape local benthic assemblages.

#### 6. Conclusion

In this study, we described the vertical composition of the water masses surrounding the ABC islands in the Southern Caribbean to a depth of  $\sim$  300 m. The general stratification of a  $\sim$  50 m thick water layer of Caribbean Surface Water (CSW) on top of the North Atlantic Subtropical Under-Water with a mixing zone between depths of 50 and 80 m was observed. This confirmed a largely similar stratification of waters observed in nearby Venezuela and Colombia, but also elsewhere in the Caribbean, e.g., the US Virgin Islands. This general stratification can be affected by local bathymetry as for example the shallower bathymetry surrounding Aruba forces a thinning of the CSW around this island. Furthermore, local signs of eutrophication were observed near areas with extensive forms of coastal development (e.g., cities, harbors, dense tourism infrastructure). In such areas indications of eutrophication were foremost noticeable as increased abundances in phytoplankton (estimated as Chl-a abundance) instead of increases in nutrient concentrations.

#### CRediT authorship contribution statement

Fleur C. van Duyl: Writing - review & editing, Writing - original draft, Project administration, Methodology, Investigation, Funding acquisition, Formal analysis, Conceptualization. Vincent E.A. Post: Writing - review & editing, Writing - original draft, Visualization, Validation, Resources, Project administration, Methodology, Investigation, Funding acquisition, Formal analysis, Data curation, Conceptualization. Boris M. van Breukelen: Writing - review & editing, Writing original draft, Validation, Resources, Project administration, Methodology, Investigation, Funding acquisition, Formal analysis, Data curation, Conceptualization. Victor Bense: Writing - review & editing, Writing - original draft, Validation, Resources, Project administration, Methodology, Investigation, Funding acquisition, Formal analysis, Data curation, Conceptualization. Petra M. Visser: Writing - review & editing, Writing - original draft, Validation, Resources, Methodology, Investigation, Formal analysis, Conceptualization. Erik H. Meesters: Writing - review & editing, Writing - original draft, Validation, Resources, Methodology, Investigation, Funding acquisition, Formal analysis, Data curation, Conceptualization. Paul Koeniger: Writing review & editing, Writing - original draft, Validation, Resources, Methodology, Investigation, Formal analysis, Data curation, Conceptualization. Mark J.A. Vermeij: Writing - review & editing, Writing original draft, Validation, Project administration, Methodology, Investigation, Funding acquisition, Formal analysis.

#### Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

#### Acknowledgements

For this paper we acknowledge the funding of the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO) and Royal Netherlands Institute for Sea Research (NIOZ) in organizing the Netherlands Initiative Changing Oceans (NICO) expedition in 2018. We thank National Marine Facilities-NIOZ (NMF) and the crew of the RV Pelagia for their helpfulness and logistic support. We are extremely grateful to Karel Bakker for conducting all nutrient measurements onboard of the Pelagia. MJAV was partly supported through the project "Land, Sea, and Society: Linking terrestrial pollutants and inputs to nearshore coral reef growth to identify novel conservation options for the Dutch Caribbean (SEAL-INK)" with project number NWOCA.2019.003 of the research program "Caribbean Research: a Multidisciplinary Approach" which is (partly) financed by the Dutch Research Council (NWO).

#### Data availability

Data will be made available on request.

#### References

- Abtmaier, B.F., 1978. Zur Hydrogeologie der Insel Curaçao (Niederländische Antillen). Groundwaterinvestigation - Curaçao Facultät für Bergbau und Hüttenwesen. Rheinische-Westfälischen Hochschule Aachen, Aachen, p. 177.
- Adam, T.C., Burkepile, D.E., Holbrook, S.J., Carpenter, R.C., Claudet, J., Loiseau, C., Thiault, L., Brooks, A.J., Washburn, L., Schmitt, R.J., 2021. Landscape-scale patterns of nutrient enrichment in a coral reef ecosystem: implications for coral to algae phase shifts. Ecol. Appl. 31, e2227.
- Andrade, C.A., Barton, E.D., 2005. The Guajira upwelling system. Cont. Shelf Res. 25, 1003–1022.
- Arboleda, E., Peachey, R.B., 2016. A Study of Water Quality Parameters of a Selection of Wells in Bonaire, 2016. CIEE Research Station, Bonaire p, p. 58.
- Astor, Y., Müller-Karger, F., Scranton, M., 2003. Seasonal and interannual variation in the hydrography of the Cariaco Basin: implications for basin ventilation. Cont. Shelf Res. 23, 125–144.
- Bak, R.P., Nieuwland, G., Meesters, E.H., 2005. Coral reef crisis in deep and shallow reefs: 30 years of constancy and change in reefs of Curaçao and Bonaire. Coral Reefs 24, 475–479.
- Becking, L., Meesters, E., 2014. Bonaire deep reef expedition I. In: IMARES Wageningen UR, Report C006/14. IMARES, Wageningen UR.
  Bell, P.R., Lapointe, B.E., Elmetri, I., 2007. Reevaluation of ENCORE: support for the
- Bell, P.R., Lapointe, B.E., Elmetri, I., 2007. Reevaluation of ENCORE: support for the eutrophication threshold model for coral reefs. AMBIO: A Journal of the Human Environment 36, 416–424.
- Bell, P.R.F., Elmetri, I., Lapointe, B.E., 2014. Evidence of large-scale chronic eutrophication in the GreatBarrier Reef: quantification of chlorophyll a thresholds for sustaining coral reef communities. AMBIO 43, 361–376.
- Bongaerts, P., Frade, P., Hay, K., Englebert, N., Latijnhouwers, K., Bak, R., Vermeij, M., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., 2015. Deep down on a Caribbean reef: lower mesophotic depths harbor a specialized coral-endosymbiont community. Sci. Rep. 5.
- Brocke, H.J., Polerecky, L., De Beer, D., Weber, M., Claudet, J., Nugues, M.M., 2015. Organic matter degradation drives benthic cyanobacterial mat abundance on Caribbean coral reefs. PlosOne 10, 19.
- Campbell, L., Vaulot, D., 1993. Photosynthetic picoplankton community structure in the subtropical North Pacific Ocean near Hawaii (station ALOHA). Deep-Sea Res. I Oceanogr. Res. Pap. 40, 2043–2060.
- Casanova-Masjoan, M., Joyce, T., Pérez-Hernández, M., Vélez-Belchí, P., Hernández-Guerra, A., 2018. Changes across 66°W, the Caribbean Sea and the Western boundaries of the North Atlantic Subtropical Gyre. Prog. Oceanogr. 168, 296–309.
- Castellanos, P., Varela, R., Muller-Karger, F., 2002. Descripción de las áreas de surgencia al sur del Mar Caribe examinadas con el sensor infrarrojo AVHRR. Memoria de la Fundación La Salle de Ciencias Naturales 154, 55–76.
- CBS-AU, 2022. Quarterly Demographic Bulletin 2022. Available at: https://cbs.aw/wp/ index.php/2022/06/16/quarterly-demographic-bulletin-2022/.
- CBS-CW, 2023. Census 2023. Central Bureau of Statistics Curaçao, Willemstad. Available at: https://www.cbs.cw/census-of-2023.
- CBS-NL, 2020. Trends in the Caribbean Netherlands 2020. Available at: https://www. cbs.nl/en-gb/publication/2020/41/trends-in-the-caribbean-netherlands-2020.

Centurioni, L., Niller, P., 2003. On the surface currents of the Caribbean Sea. Geophys. Res. Lett. 30, 1279.

- Cervantes-Díaz, G.Y., Hernández-Ayón, J.M., Zirino, A., Herzka, S.Z., Camacho-Ibar, V., Norzagaray, O., Barbero, L., Montes, I., Sudre, J., Delgado, J.A., 2022. Understanding upper water mass dynamics in the Gulf of Mexico by linking physical and biogeochemical features. J. Mar. Syst. 225, e103647.
- Chérubin, L.M., Richardson, P.L., 2007. Caribbean current variability and the influence of the Amazon and Orinoco freshwater plumes. Deep-Sea Res. I Oceanogr. Res. Pap. 54, 1451–1473.
- Chollett, I., Mumby, P., Müller-Karger, F., Hu, C., 2012. Physical environments of the Caribbean Sea. Limnol. Oceanogr. 57, 1233–1244.

- Correa-Ramirez, M., Rodriguez-Santana, Á., Ricaurte-Villota, C., Paramo, J., 2019. Water masses and mixing processes in the southern Caribbean upwelling system off Colombia. Ocean Science Discussions 1–26.
- Corredor, J.E., 1979. Phytoplankton response to low level nutrient enrichment through upwelling in the Columbian Caribbean Basin. Deep Sea Research Part A. Oceanographic Research Papers 26, 731–741.
- Corredor, J.E., Morell, J.M., 2001. Seasonal variation of physical and biogeochemical features in eastern Caribbean Surface Water. J. Geophys. Res. Oceans 106, 4517–4525.
- De Bakker, D.M., van Duyl, F.C., Perry, C.T., Meesters, E.H., 2019. Extreme spatial heterogeneity in carbonate accretion potential on a Caribbean fringing reef linked to local human disturbance gradients. Glob. Chang. Biol. 25, 4092–4104.
- De'ath, G., Fabricius, K., 2010. Water quality as a regional driver of coral biodiversity and macroalgae on the Great Barrier Reef. Ecol. Appl. 20, 840–850.
- DeGeorges, A., Goreau, T.J., Reilly, B., 2010. Land-sourced pollution with an emphasis on domestic sewage: lessons from the Caribbean and implications for coastal development on Indian Ocean and Pacific coral reefs. Sustainability 2, 2919–2949.
- Den Haan, J., Huisman, J., Brocke, H.J., Goelich, H., Latijnhouwers, K.R., Van Heeringen, S., Honcoop, S.A.S., Bleyenberg, T.E., Schouten, S., Cerli, C., Hoitinga, L., Vermeij, M.J.A., Visser, P.M., 2016. Nitrogen and phosphorus uptake rates of different species from a coral reef community after a nutrient pulse. Sci. Rep. 6, 28821.
- Diaz-Pulido, G., Garzon-Ferreira, J., 2002. Seasonality in algal assemblages on upwelling-influenced coral reefs in the Colombian Caribbean. Bot. Mar. 45, 284–292.
- DMA, 2019. Climate Data Aruba. Available at: http://www.meteo.aw/climate.php. Fabricius, K.E., 2005. Effects of terrestrial runoff on the ecology of corals and coral reefs: review and synthesis. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 50, 125–146.
- Ford, A.K., Bejarano, S., Nugues, M.M., Visser, P.M., Albert, S., Ferse, S.C.A., 2018. Reefs under siege—the rise, putative drivers, and consequences of benthic cyanobacterial Mats. Front. Mar. Sci. 5, 18.
- Frade, P.R., Bongaerts, P., Baldwin, C.C., Trembanis, A.C., Bak, R.P.M., Vermeij, M.J.A., 2019. Bonaire and Curaçao. In: Loya, Y., Puglise, K.A., Bridge, T.C.L. (Eds.), Mesophotic Coral Ecosystems: A Lifeboat for Coral Reefs? Springer International, Cham, pp. 149–162.
- Fratantoni, D.M., 2001. North Atlantic surface circulation during the 1990's observed with satellite-tracked drifters. J. Geophys. Res. 106, 22067–22093.
- Gast, G.J., Wiegman, S., Wieringa, E., van Duyl, F.C., Bak, R.P.M., 1998. Bacteria in coral reef water types: removal of cells, stimulation of growth and mineralization. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 167, 37–45.
- Gast, G.J., Jonkers, P.J., van Duyl, F.C., Bak, R.P.M., 1999. Bacteria, flagellates and nutrients in island fringing coral reef waters: influence of the ocean, the reef and eutrophication. Bull. Mar. Sci. 65, 523–538.
- Gyory, J., Mariano, A.J., Ryan, E.H., 2009. The Caribbean current. In: Ocean Surface Currents. Available at: http://oceancurrents.rsmas.miami.edu/caribbean/caribbean. html.
- Häder, D.P., Banaszak, A.T., Villafañe, V.E., Narvarte, M.A., González, R.A., Helbling, E. W., 2020. Anthropogenic pollution of aquatic ecosystems: emerging problems with global implications. Sci. Total Environ. 713, 136586.
- Hernández-Guerra, A., Joyce, T.M., 2000. Water masses and circulation in the surface layers of the Caribbean at 66°W. Geophys. Res. Lett. 27, 3497–3500.
- Hummelinck, P.W., 1943. Over grotten en grottenvorming op Curaçao, Aruba en Bonaire. De West-Indische Gids 25, 365–375.
- Hydes, J., Aoyama, M., Aminot, A., Bakker, K., Becker, S., Coverly, S., Daniel, A., Dickson, A.G., Grosso, O., Kerouel, R., van Ooijen, J., Sato, K., Tanhua, T., Woodward, E.M.S., Zhang, J.Z., 2010. Determination of dissolved nutrients (N, P, Si) in seawater with high precision and inter-comparability using gas-segmented continuous flow analysers (GO-SHIP Repeat Hydrography Manual: A collection of Expert Reports and Guidelines). In: ICPO Publication Series No. 123 version 1 IOCCP Report No. 14.
- IBM Corporation, 2021. IBM SPSS Statistics for Windows, Version 28.0. IBM Corp, Armonk, NY.
- Jackson, J., Donavan, M., Cramer, K., Lam, V., 2013. Status and Trends of Caribbean Coral Reefs: 1970–2012, CEP Technical Report. IUCN, UNEP, p. 303.
- Jentzen, A., Nürnberg, D., Hathorne, E., Schönfeld, J., 2018. Mg/Ca and 8<sup>18</sup>O in living planktic foraminifers from the Caribbean, Gulf of Mexico and Florida Straits. Biogeosciences 15, 7077–7095.
- Johns, W., Townsend, T., Fratantoni, D., Wilson, W., 2002. On the Atlantic inflow to the Caribbean Sea. Deep-Sea Res. I Oceanogr. Res. Pap. 49, 211–243.
- Joyce, T., Hernández-Guerra, A., Smethie Jr., W., 2001. Zonal circulation in the NW Atlantic and Caribbean from a meridional World Ocean Circulation Experiment hydrographic section at 66°W. J. Geophys. Res. Oceans 106, 22095–22113.
- Jury, M., 2018. Eastern Venezuela coastal upwelling in context of regional weather and climate variability. Reg. Stud. Mar. Sci. 18, 219–228.
- Lapointe, B.E., Mallin, M., 2011. Nutrient Enrichment and Eutrophication on Fringing Coral Reefs on Bonaire and Curaçao, Netherlands Antilles. Report. Available at: https://www.dcbd.nl/document/nutrient-enrichment-and-eutrophication-fringing-coral-reefs-bonaire-and-cura%C3%A7ao-netherlands.
- Lapointe, B.E., O'Connell, J.D., Garrett, G.S., 1990. Nutrient couplings between on-site sewage disposal systems, groundwaters, and nearshore surface waters of the Florida Keys. Biogeochemistry 10, 289–307.
- Leichter, J.J., Helmuth, B., Fischer, A.M., 2006. Variation beneath the surface: quantifying complex thermal environments on coral reefs in the Caribbean, Bahamas and Florida. J. Mar. Res. 64, 563–588.
- Marra, 1997. Analysis of diel variability in chlorophyll fluorescence. J. Mar. Res. 55, 767–784.

#### F.C. van Duyl et al.

McConnell, M., Thunell, R., Lorenzoni, L., Astor, Y., Wright, J., Fairbanks, R., 2009. Seasonal variability in the salinity and oxygen isotopic composition of seawater from the Cariaco Basin, Venezuela: implications for paleosalinity reconstructions. Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst. 10, 15.

- McCook, L., 1999. Macroalgae, nutrients and phase shifts on coral reefs: scientific issues and management consequences for the great barrier reef. Coral Reefs 18, 357–367. McManus, J.W., Polsenberg, J.F., 2004. Coral–algal phase shifts on coral reefs: ecological
- and environmental aspects. Prog. Oceanogr. 60, 263–279. MDC, 2023. The Dutch Leeward Islands. Willemstad. Availabe at: https://www.meteo.
- cw/climate.php?Lang=Eng&St=TNCC&Sws=R11. Metcalf, W.G., 1976. Caribbean-Atlantic water exchange through the Anegada-Jungfern
- passage. J. Geophys. Res. 81, 6401–6409. Moeller, H.V., Laufkötter, C., Sweeney, E.M., Johnson, M.D., 2019. Light-dependent grazing can drive formation and deepening of deep chlorophyll maxima. Nat. Commun. 10. 1978.
- Moosdorf, N., Stieglitz, T., Waska, H., Dürr, H., Hartmann, J., 2015. Submarine groundwater discharge from tropical islands: a review. Grundwasser 20, 53–67.
- Morrison, J., Nowlin, W., 1982. General distribution of water masses within the eastern Caribbean Sea during the winter of 1972 and fall of 1973. J. Geophys. Res. Oceans 87, 4207–4229.
- Müller-Karger, F., McClain, C., Fisher, T., Esaias, W., Varela, R., 1989. Pigment distribution in the Caribbean sea: observations from space. Prog. Oceanogr. 23, 23–64.
- Nelson, S.T., 2000. A simple, practical methodology for routine VSMOW/SLAP normalization of water samples analyzed by continuous flow methods. Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom. 14, 1044–1046.
- Pawlowicz, R., 2010. What every Oceanographer Needs to Know About TEOS-10 (The TEOS-10 Primer). Unpublished manuscript. Available at www.TEOS-10.org.
- Qu, T., Zhang, L., Schneider, N., 2016. North Atlantic Subtropical Underwater and its year-to-year variability in annual subduction rate during the Argo Period. J. Phys. Oceanogr. 46, 1901–1916.
- Rueda-Roa, D., Müller-Karger, F., 2013. The southern Caribbean upwelling system: sea surface temperature, wind forcing and chlorophyll concentration patterns. Deep-Sea Res. I Oceanogr. Res. Pap. 78, 102–114.
- Sandin, S.A., Alcantar, E., Clark, R., de León, R., Dilrosun, F., Edwards, C.B., Estep, A.J., Eynaud, Y., French, B.J., Fox, M.D., 2022. Benthic assemblages are more predictable than fish assemblages at an island scale. Coral Reefs 41, 1031–1043.
- SARAD GmbH, 2007. Measurement of the Radon Concentration of Water Samples. SARAD Application Note AN-003\_EN, Germany.
- Schmutz, P., Potter, A., Modlin Jr., A., 2017. Aruba, Bonaire, and Curaçao. In: Allen, C. (Ed.), Landscapes and Landforms of the Lesser Antilles. Springer International Publishing, Cham, pp. 293–317.
- Skirving, W., Marsh, B., De La Cour, J., Liu, G., Harris, A., Maturi, E., Geiger, E., Eakin, C. M., 2020. CoralTemp and the coral reef watch coral bleaching heat stress product suite version 3.1. Remote Sens. (Basel) 12, 3856.
- Slijkerman, D.M.E., De Leon, R., De Vries, P., 2014. A base-line water quality assessment of the coastal reefs of Bonaire, Southern Caribbean. Mar Poll Bull 86, 523–529.
- Suchley, A., Alvarez-Filip, L., 2018. Local human activities limit marine protection efficacy on Caribbean coral reefs. Conserv. Lett. 11, e12571.

- Szmant, A.M., 2002. Nutrient enrichment on coral reefs: is it a major cause of coral reef decline? Estuaries 25, 743–766.
- Torregroza-Espinosa, A.C., Restrepo, J.C., Escobar, J., Pierini, J., Newton, A., 2021. Spatial and temporal variability of temperature, salinity and chlorophyll-a in the Magdalena River mouth, Caribbean Sea. J. South Am. Earth Sci. 105, 102978.
- Torres, R.R., Latandret, S., Salon, J., Dagua, C., 2023. Water masses in the Caribbean Sea and sub-annual variability in the Guajira upwelling region. Ocean Dyn. 73, 39–57.
- Van den Hoek, C., Breeman, A.M., Bak, R., Van Buurt, G., 1978. The distribution of algae, corals and gorgonians in relation to depth, light attenuation, water movement and grazing pressure in the fringing coral reef of Curaçao, Netherlands Antilles. Aquat. Bot. 5, 1–46.
- Van den Hoek, C., Cortel-Breeman, A., Wanders, J., 1975. Algal zonation in the fringing coral reef of Curaçao, Netherlands Antilles, in relation to zonation of corals and gorgonians. Aquatic Botany 1, 269–308.
- Van den Oever, F., 2000. Aruba a geochemical baseline study. Neth. J. Geosci. 79, 467–477.
- Van Duyl, F.C., 1985. Atlas of the living reefs of Curaçao and Bonaire (Netherlands Antilles). In: Studies of the Flora and Fauna of Surinam and the Netherlands Antilles, 117, pp. 1–37.
- Van Duyl, F.C., Gast, G.J., 2001. Linkage of small-scale spatial variations in DOC, inorganic nutrients and bacterioplankton growth with different coral reef water types. Aquat. Microb. Ecol. 24, 17–24.
- Van Duyl, F.C., Gast, G.J., Steinhoff, W., Kloff, S., Veldhuis, M., Bak, R.P.M., 2002. Factors influencing the short-term variation in phytoplankton composition and biomass in coral reef waters. Coral Reefs 21, 293–306.
- Van Sambeek, M.H., Eggenkamp, H.G.M., Vissers, M., 2000. The groundwater quality of Aruba, Bonaire and Curaçao: a hydrogeochemical study. Geol. Mijnb. 79, 459–466.
- Vermeij, M.J.A., Bak, R.P.M., 2003. Species-specific population structure of closely related coral morphospecies along a depth gradient (5–60 m) over a Caribbean reef slope. Bull. Mar. Sci. 73, 725–744.
- Vermeij, M.J.A., Marhaver, K.L., Estep, A.J., Sandin, S., 2019. The State of the Reefs around Aruba, Report for the Government of Aruba. Carmabi Foundation, Willemstad, p. 211. Available at: https://www.dcbd.nl/sites/default/files/document s/Aruba%20Report%20Final%20%281%29.pdf.
- Watanabe, T., Winter, A., Oba, T., 2001. Seasonal changes in sea surface temperature and salinity during the Little Ice Age in the Caribbean Sea deduced from Mg/Ca and 180/160 ratios in corals. Mar. Geol. 173, 21–35.
- Wear, S.L., Thurber, R.V., 2015. Sewage pollution: mitigation is key for coral reef stewardship. Ann. N. Y. Acad. Sci. 1355, 15–30.
- Westermann, J., 1949. Overzicht van de mijnbouwgeologische kennis der Nederlandse Antillen. Meded. Kon. Ver. Indisch Instituut, Amsterdam, pp. 1–168.
- Wiedenmann, J., D'Angelo, C., Smith, E.G., Hunt, A.N., Legiret, F.-E., Postle, A.D., Achterberg, E.P., 2013. Nutrient enrichment can increase the susceptibility of reef corals to bleaching. Nat. Clim. Chang. 3, 160–164.
- Wüst, G., 1963. On the stratification and the circulation in the cold watersphere of the Antillean-Caribbean basins. In: An Abstract Deep Sea Research and Oceanographic Abstracts, 10, pp. 165–187.
- Zakem, E.J., Al-Haj, A., Church, M.J., van Dijken, G.L., Dutkiewicz, S., Foster, S.Q., Fulweiler, R.W., Mills, M.M., Follows, M.J., 2018. Ecological control of nitrite in the upper ocean. Nat. Commun. 9, 1206.